Case Study #1: English/Language Arts Middle School Graduate

The alum profiled in this case study graduated from York College Teacher Education English Middle School Extension program within the last 3 years. In this case study, the pronouns "they/their" will be used to support the anonymity of the participant.

The data in the tables included in the case study were based upon the alum's self-assessment of teaching prior to the transition to distance learning in the 2019-2020 academic year, focusing on a lesson segment based upon the book "The Hate You Give." The faulty member's ratings in these tables were based upon interviews with the alum and written materials shared by the alum including lesson plans and observations reports by principals.

Across all measures of teacher effectiveness and impact on student learning, the alum in this case study performed at the Effective of Highly Effective level.

Assessment D: Effective Teaching Work Sample (ETWS)

TASK1: Context Analysis

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
Knowledge of Teaching Context -Community	4	4
Knowledge of Teaching Context -School	4	4
Knowledge of Teaching Context -Classroom	4	4
Knowledge of Students	4	4
Implications for Instructional Planning and Assessment	4	4

Discussion:
The alum demonstrated substantial insights about the teaching context, including the community, school, classroom, and especially the students. The alum used these insights when planning for instruction and assessment. For example, the text selection was driven by their understanding of the cultural backgrounds of their students and the challenges faced within the community. Evidence of this included the alum's depiction of their students' reaction to the lesson segment. They described the students' high level of engagement with the learning tasks and their ability to connect the main text and supplemental texts to their own lives and communities. The alum described school priorities based upon students' past performance and the ways that she integrated those priorities into their planning.

TASK 2: Standards & Research-based Learning Outcomes

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
Learning segment articulates a central focus	4	4
Learning objectives align with the central focus	4	4
Learning objectives align with NYSCC Learning Standards and other disciplinary standards*	4	4
Learning objectives connect with knowledge of students' prior knowledge, interests, and cultural/community assets	4	4
Learning objectives connect with knowledge of students' prior learning and development and therefore predict misunderstandings	4	4

Discussion:

The alum created a coherent lesson segment that was driven by age appropriate ELA standards and their understanding of the students' cultures and academic skill levels. The alum reported that this unit was newly created this year by the alum and their fellow teachers. They prioritized making the unit relevant for their students and focused on close reading of text and use of evidence in writing. The alum reported having created

TASK 3: Planning for Assessment

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
Assessments align with the central focus, standards, and learning objectives	4	4
The plan includes aligned pre- and post-assessments	4	4
The plan includes several opportunities for the teacher to conduct formative assessments	4	4
Plans include adaptations/ modifications of assessments	4	4

	4	4
Plans include quality assessment instruments including assessments adapted for ELLs	4	4
Plans include a variety of assessment instrument(s)	4	4
Assessment Plan Commentary. Include commentary on research /theory for ELLs	3	4

Discussion:

The alum identified assessment as one of their strengths as an educator, attributing their expertise to their experiences at York. They described the connection between the lesson segment standards and objectives and all assessments. They administer a pre-assessment at the beginning of every unit and make instructional decisions, such as grouping and differentiation, based upon students' results. The alum discussed the previous year's challenges in getting students to take pre-assessments seriously and new strategies they implemented this year to improve the quality of the data. They shared a range of formative assessments that they use to monitor student progress and described the way that they use data from the formative assessments modify instructional plans, claiming to be both highly planful and flexible in response to student needs. All shared assessments from the lesson segment included modifications for students with scaffolds that targeted individual learning needs based upon previous performance.

TASK 4: Lesson Plans

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
The plan is clearly articulated	4	4
The plan reflects pedagogical content knowledge	4	4
The plan reflects content knowledge	4	4
The plan follows an organized progression of activities - a logical flow	4	4
The plan includes a variety of instructional strategies	4	4
The plan includes the deliberate grouping of students when appropriate	4	4
The plan includes differentiation for students based on an understanding of the different needs of the students in the classroom	4	4
The plan includes academic language	4	4

The plan includes the implementation of digital technology	3	4
The plan cites research/theory	3	4

Discussion:

Lesson plans from the learning segment demonstrate significant embodiment of content knowledge and pedagogical content knowledge. The lesson plans are detailed and follow a logical learning progression. The plans include differentiated learning tasks that students pursue in deliberately structured groups. In several plans the students have the opportunity to use technology as a learning tool. The alum discussed their understanding of the importance of socio-emotional learning for her adolescents and the ways this understanding affected their lesson planning..

TASK 5: Impact on Student Learning

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
Graphic Presentation of Data	NA	4
Interpretation of Data for Whole Class	3	4
Interpretation of Data for Three Students	4	4
Data Demonstrate Positive Effect of Instruction	4	4
Implications for Future Teaching "Next Steps"	4	4
Accuracy and Completeness of Data Collection	3	4

Discussion

The alum discussed the positive impacts that they had on their students' learning during this learning segment. They claimed to use spread sheets rather than graphical representations to analyze the performance data. They shared that only one student demonstrated a performance drop from the pre-assessment to the post-assessment. This one student was absent for most of the unit because of a family tragedy and the class celebrated her resilience when celebrating their gains. The alum described dramatic increases in performance by most students in the class. They described gains by target students who had past weak performances in ELA and socio-emotional challenges, detailing their improvements and the reasons for them. The alum based plans for future instruction on the students' performance in this lesson segment, highlighting the need to continue to be culturally relevant in order for the students to increase in academic skills.

Assessment I: Lesson Evaluation Part B: Observation Evaluation

Component	Principal Assessment *Informal observation* Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
The Learner and Learning		
1. Establishes a positive learning environment. Respect and rapport are evident.	4	4
2. Demonstrates flexibility and responsiveness to students' diverse needs.	4	4
Content Knowledge		
3. Demonstrates pedagogical content knowledge.	4	4
4. Demonstrates content knowledge.	4	4
Instructional Practices		
5. Effectively models and/or uses demonstration or representation (chart/picture/poster) to support learning a strategy or skill.	NA	4
6. Presents learning tasks in a manner that engages students.	NA	4
7. Engages students in learning tasks to support the mastery of academic language.	4	4
8. Uses a variety of questions to elicit and build on student responses to deepen content understanding.	3	4
9. Uses questioning to monitor student learning.	3	4
10. Appropriately responds to formative assessment data with instructional decisions and feedback to students.	3	4
11. Connects new content to prior learning as well as cultural and personal assets.	4	4
12. Engages students in challenging work and conveys his/her high expectations for the students.	3	4
13. Demonstrates an ability to manage time (closure).	3	4
14. Demonstrates an ability to manage	4	4

classroom rules, routines, and materials		
15. Demonstrates an ability to manage classroom space.	4	4
16. Demonstrates an ability to use technology effectively.	3	4
17. Makes a positive impact on student learning.	4	4

Discussion:

The Principal's ratings are from related items on an informal observation form.

Assessment C
Dispositions Assessment

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Self Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
1. Addressing Individual Student Needs	4	4
2. Cultural and Linguistic Awareness	4	4
3. Openness to Technology	4	4
4. Support All Students	4	4
5. Student-centered Classroom Management	4	4
6. Collaboration	4	4
7. Professional Interactions	4	4
8. Problem Solving	4	4
9. Professional Ethics	4	4
10. Timeliness	4	4
11. Responsible for student learning	4	4
12. Lifelong Learner	4	4
13. Openness Feedback	4	4
14. Reflective Practice	4	4

Discussion:

The alum discussed students' individual learning needs and their cultural and linguistic backgrounds in detail. They demonstrated using this as the basis for all planning. The alum shared ways that technology is infused into their class, both in use by the teacher and the students. They provided extensive examples of collaborating with colleagues and mentoring new teachers in the school. They shared on-going professional development experiences and pursuit of a Masters degree as evidence of being a lifelong learner. Discussions of administrator observations and goal setting meetings demonstrated openness to feedback and reflective practice.

Case Study#2: Childhood Education/Spanish Bilingual Extension Graduate

The alum profiled in this case study graduated from York College Teacher Education Childhood Bilingual Extension program within the last 3 years. In this case study, the pronouns "they/their" will be used to support the anonymity of the participant.

The data in the tables included in the case study were based upon the alum's self-assessment of teaching prior to the transition to distance learning in the 2019-2020 academic year, focusing on a math lesson segment. The faulty member's ratings in these tables were based upon interviews with the alum, observations conducted in the classroom prior to the NYC DOE closure due to COVID 19 and changes to the project's IRB, and written materials shared by the alum including lesson plans and anonymous student assessment data.

Across all measures of teacher effectiveness and impact on student learning, the alum in this case study performed at the Effective of Highly Effective level.

Assessment D: Effective Teaching Work Sample (ETWS)

TASK1: Context Analysis

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
Knowledge of Teaching Context -Community	4	4
Knowledge of Teaching Context -School	4	4
Knowledge of Teaching Context -Classroom	4	4
Knowledge of Students	4	4
Implications for Instructional Planning and Assessment	4	4

Discussion:
The interview with the alum was insightful and gave the researcher a complete understanding of the community, the school culture, and the students in the school and in the alum's class. The alum spoke in detail about the community's assets and areas of need. The rich linguistic and cultural diversity of the community was highlighted as a resource for the school. Socio political pressures were discussed as challenges for the students and their families. The alum spoke at great length and with substantial detail about the students and

their families, both in the classroom and overall at the school. The context of the community was a driving force in both the planning of grade level thematic units and the resources that are available. The school itself is new and well equipped with an organizational structure that allows for professional collaboration at and between the grade levels. The programmatic model at the school is a dual bilingual program (English/Spanish) whereby students are instructed in two languages with a goal of bilingualism for all students upon completion of fifth grade. The school views language as a resource and as a right for all students. The goal is that students of both languages, those entering with English or Spanish as a home or primary language, will develop both basic interpersonal communication skills (BICS) and cognitive academic language proficiency (CALP) in two languages. The alum spoke about how the educational program at York prepared them for working with a linguistically diverse student population, and especially, in teaching in a dual language bilingual context.

TASK 2: Standards & Research-based Learning Outcomes

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
Learning segment articulates a central focus	4	4
Learning objectives align with the central focus	4	4
Learning objectives align with NYSCC Learning Standards and other disciplinary standards*	4	4
Learning objectives connect with knowledge of students' prior knowledge, interests, and cultural/community assets	4	4
Learning objectives connect with knowledge of students' prior learning and development and therefore predict misunderstandings	4	4

Discussion:
The structure of the school is that curriculum at the grade levels is divided into content areas with teachers taking responsibility for one or two areas. The alum in this case study was the math teacher at the grade level. The alum and the partner teacher shared two sets of students. This means the alum was responsible for teaching the grade level math content to their own "home room" as well as the students in the partner's class. These two sets of students from two classrooms received their math instruction in Spanish on certain days of the week, and in English on other days of the week. Planning was done on a weekly basis with the partner teacher as well as with other teachers at the grade level teaching the same

curriculum. The grade level standards were the guidelines for instruction and were included in all lesson planning. In addition to the grade level content standards, the NYS Engage Bilingual standards were also consulted and planned for. Students' language levels from Entering to Commanding were considered in all lessons. The alum spoke in detail how the math content and curriculum were geared so that students could relate to the concepts in real time, and in connection to their backgrounds and experiences.

TASK 3: Planning for Assessment

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
Assessments align with the central focus, standards, and learning objectives	4	4
The plan includes aligned pre- and post-assessments	4	3
The plan includes several opportunities for the teacher to conduct formative assessments	4	4
Plans include adaptations/ modifications of assessments	4	3
Plans include quality assessment instruments including assessments adapted for ELLs	4	4
Plans include a variety of assessment instrument(s)	4	4
Assessment Plan Commentary. Include commentary on research /theory for ELLs	4	4

Discussion:
Assessment was a driving force in all planning. The alum's grade level is a "testing" grade and the outcomes are high stakes for the students and the school. Assessment was built into every lesson, with both formative and summative assessments planned in advance. Assessment was ongoing throughout the lessons in the form of questioning, asking students for feedback, continual monitoring of students' engagement and progress as the lesson developed, and students were frequently asked to self-assess as the lesson progressed. The results of daily assessment were used to adjust instruction as needed throughout the week and the unit segments. While assessment was identified as the driving force in planning and instruction, it was not the goal of either; rather it was a tool that allowed the alum to keep on track with the grade level standards yet maintain a student-centered approach to teaching. This means that the assessment results were used to inform instruction, in real time, as teaching was taking place, as well as for planning future lessons. As the bilingual teacher assessment had to also be adjusted with students' language level in mind.

TASK 4: Lesson Plans

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
The plan is clearly articulated	4	4
The plan reflects pedagogical content knowledge	4	4
The plan reflects content knowledge	4	4
The plan follows an organized progression of activities - a logical flow	4	4
The plan includes a variety of instructional strategies	4	3
The plan includes the deliberate grouping of students when appropriate	4	4
The plan includes differentiation for students based on an understanding of the different needs of the students in the classroom	4	3
The plan includes academic language	4	4
The plan includes the implementation of digital technology	4	4
The plan cites research/theory	4	3

Discussion:
The lesson plans were organized and contained all the elements and components of an effective or highly effective lesson. The alum shared lesson plans with the researcher and they demonstrated each of the above component in detail. The three areas where the alum rated themselves at the effective level rather than the highly effective level was a result of deep reflection on their part. Because of the linguistic considerations, the challenges of working with 60 students every day, the alum felt they could "improve" in each of the areas. However, for the researcher, upon discussing these areas with the alum, it became evident that they had indeed met the level of "highly effective" in their lesson and segment plans. This was especially so in the "cites research/theory". In the interview discussion, the alum quoted many expert studies and resources that helped them in both planning and instruction. The alum cited their coursework at York as preparing them with the theoretical constructs that now were helping them to operationalize their instruction.

TASK 5: Impact on Student Learning

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
Graphic Presentation of Data	4	4
Interpretation of Data for Whole Class	4	4
Interpretation of Data for Three Students	4	4
Data Demonstrate Positive Effect of Instruction	4	4
Implications for Future Teaching "Next Steps"	4	4
Accuracy and Completeness of Data Collection	4	4

Discussion
The alum spoke at great lengths about how ongoing formative and summative assessment s informed their teaching and planning. Record keeping was ongoing so that the alum could zero in on students' needs. During the lesson the alum would gather "on the ground" formative assessment and adjust teaching, and student grouping. Student groups were flexible and fluid based on these formative assessments. Because the grade level was a "testing grade" summative assessments were analyzed for students' strengths and weaknesses, and changes were made when necessary. The alum spoke about a specific lesson segment where they had to revise the plan so as to improve the students' understanding of a mathematical construct. The material had to be presented in another way, using different strategies and materials so that the students would relate to it. When that was done, there was a dramatic improvement in the assessment results. Assessment results were kept in great details for all students, and the alum was able to produce various graphic analyses of these results. The alum was able to pinpoint students who were scoring at both the above and below level expectations. The alum also worked with a push in special needs teacher on certain days. The progress of students with special needs was also analyzed and planned for in conjunction with that professional colleague.

Assessment I: Lesson Evaluation Part B: Observation Evaluation

Component	Researcher Assessment *Informal observation* Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
The Learner and Learning		
1. Establishes a positive learning environment. Respect and rapport are evident.	4	4
2. Demonstrates flexibility and responsiveness to students' diverse needs.	4	4
Content Knowledge		
3. Demonstrates pedagogical content knowledge.	4	4
4. Demonstrates content knowledge.	4	4
Instructional Practices		
5. Effectively models and/or uses demonstration or representation (chart/picture/poster) to support learning a strategy or skill.	4	4
6. Presents learning tasks in a manner that engages students.	4	4
7. Engages students in learning tasks to support the mastery of academic language.	4	4
8. Uses a variety of questions to elicit and build on student responses to deepen content understanding.	4	4
9. Uses questioning to monitor student learning.	4	4
10. Appropriately responds to formative assessment data with instructional decisions and feedback to students.	4	4
11. Connects new content to prior learning as well as cultural and personal assets.	4	4
12. Engages students in challenging work and conveys his/her high expectations for the	4	4

students.		
13. Demonstrates an ability to manage time (closure).	4	4
14. Demonstrates an ability to manage classroom rules, routines, and materials	4	4
15. Demonstrates an ability to manage classroom space.	4	4
16. Demonstrates an ability to use technology effectively.	4	4
17. Makes a positive impact on student learning.	4	4

Discussion:

The Researcher's ratings are from an observation that took place prior to the NYC DOE COVID-19 closure in March 2020. All components were easily identifiable in the lesson delivery. The alum had a clear understanding of their students and respect and rapport were clearly present. The instructional components were strong, with a variety of strategies and informal assessments ongoing throughout the lesson. The lesson began with a reference to prior learning, and the lessons' goals were stated so that the students could understand where the lesson was headed. The lesson was very well executed: Background knowledge was ascertained, a mini lesson was taught, the content being taught was enhanced with visuals and was modeled by the alum, there was a "release of control" so the students could practice the skill in small groups, and be engaged in their own learning with peers, while the alum circulated the room and assisted those who needed clarification or more explanation. At the end of the lesson, a brief summative assessment was collected (exit slip) to be used to ascertain if the students had achieved the lesson's aim, as well as to plan for the next day's instruction.

Assessment C: Dispositions Assessment

Component	Faculty Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)	Alum Assessment Highly Effective (4) Effective (3) Developing (2) Ineffective (1)
1. Addressing Individual Student Needs	4	4
2. Cultural and Linguistic Awareness	4	4
3. Openness to Technology	4	3
4. Support All Students	4	3
5. Student-centered Classroom Management	4	4
6. Collaboration	4	4
7. Professional Interactions	4	4
8. Problem Solving	4	4
9. Professional Ethics	4	4
10. Timeliness	4	3

11. Responsible for student learning	4	4
12. Lifelong Learner	4	4
13. Openness Feedback	4	4
14. Reflective Practice	4	4

Discussion:

The alum was strong in all areas. They recounted how they were well prepared to exhibit or possess these dispositions as a result of their preparation at York College. They felt they were 'effective' in three of these dispositions and 'very effective' in the remaining ones. In the discussion with the alum, the three areas where the self-assessment was at the 'effective' level were discussed. The issues of timeliness and support for all students had more to do with the constant changing of students on a daily basis, and their ability to reach all students who were at a wide range of language skills in either English or Spanish. The alum talked about how they would like to have more technology software available to use in their instruction, and individual iPads for their students. Overall, the alum demonstrated strong dispositional qualities that served their students, their school, and their community well.